Why use elicitation?

• Well, for example...
  • Technology is at early stage and no trial data with human subjects exists
  • Technology is in use but data has not been collected
  • Technology is in use but randomisation is not possible and causal attribution is problematic
  • Interest is in long-run consequences beyond trial endpoints
  • Results do not generalise from the trial setting to the target setting

Example: Anti-Microbial Resistance

• Technology is at early stage and no trial data with human subjects exists
  • Strong pressure for government to provide upfront payment early in the development cycle
• Technology is in use but data has not been collected
  • Trial data is often noninferiority trials or trial data does not even exist for older antibiotics
• Technology is in use but randomisation is not possible and causal attribution is problematic
  • Stewardship interventions are public health interventions and applied at the population level
• Interest is in long-run consequences beyond trial endpoints
  • Interest is in preventing the spread of resistant pathogens and protecting the lastline antibiotics (eg Colistin)
• Results do not generalise from the trial setting to the target setting
  • Response to treatment depends on local characteristics of the epidemic
Experts provided assessments for 2018, 2021, and 2026.

- Elicitations led by Abby Colson
- This research has received support from the Innovative Medicines Initiative Joint Undertaking under grant agreement n°115618 [Driving re-investment in R&D and responsible antibiotic use – DRIVE-AB – www.drive-ab.eu], resources of which are composed of financial contribution from the European Union’s Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) and EFPIA companies’ in kind contribution.

Can we really believe experts?

- The history of medicine is littered with experts who were confident but wrong
  - Venice treacle as a remedy for bubonic plague
  - Radical mastectomy for breast cancer
  - Thalidomide is “completely safe”
Expert judgement is just another form of data

• Follow protocols in eliciting expert judgement
  • Protocols do exist (though not in health)
• Don’t rely on one expert
  • Ask multiple people and pool or compare experts
• Validate experts
  • Can experts give right answers where the answer is known?
• Monitor conflicts of interest
  • Select your expert panels accordingly
• Recognise perhaps there are some subjects on which there are no experts
  • What will be the rate of knee replacements in the year 2500?