Novel Approaches to Value Assessment, Beyond Cost-Effectiveness Framework

Reed Johnson, PhD
Duke University
Durham, NC, USA

Nonmarket Valuation in Health Economics

F. Reed Johnson, PhD
Professor, Department of Population Health Sciences
Duke University

Preference Evaluation Research Group
Traditional Value Assessment

\[
\text{ICER} = \frac{C_{\text{ExpTrx}} - C_{\text{StdCare}}}{QALYs_{\text{ExpTrx}} - QALYs_{\text{StdCare}}}
\]

Other Dimensions of Value

Option value
Care burden
Value of knowing
Equity
Value of hope
Altruism for others

Cost
Clinical benefits

Value

Adapted from Garrison L, 2016 and Neumann PJ, 2016..
Non-Market Valuation Methods

- Conventional cost-benefit analysis traditionally based on values revealed in market transactions
- Many important decisions require information about values for which there are no markets or existing markets involve administered prices that do not represent actual values
- Development of nonmarket-valuation methods in environmental economics

A Short History of CEA and CBA

**HEALTH**
- **1970** Fanshel, Bush, and Torrance health indexes
- **1976** Zeckhauser and Shepard use term QALYs
- **1977** Weinstein and Stason CEA for health
- **1980** Pliskin on QALY theory
- **1996** Gold et al. standards for CEA

**NON-HEALTH**
- **1974** Mäler theory of nonmarket valuation
- **1981** Reagan Executive Order 12291
- **1989** Mitchell and Carson on empirical methods
- **1992** Exxon Valdez oil spill
- **1994** Federal standards nonmarket valuation
Mental-Health Community Values

Direct Costs
- Medical care
- Lost productivity
- Housing
- Social services
- Crime

Indirect Costs
- Family disruption
- Distress at seeing homeless people
- Spillover effects of drug abuse
- Personal concerns about crime

Opportunity Costs
- Diversion of public resources from other health and social priorities

Research Strategy

- What is the value of related community benefits without reference to mental health?
- What is the value of a generic mental-health program relative to other budget priorities?
- What is the value of a program for treating the named mental-health condition?
Which kinds of problems are most important?

Suppose the [STATE] legislature were considering expanding current programs to reduce the numbers of people who are unemployed, commit serious crimes, or are homeless. Expanding these programs would help more people to live, work, learn, and participate more fully in their communities.

Suppose also that your state representative sent you a letter asking whether he or she should vote for or against expansions of existing programs.

Example Question-Related Community Benefits

If paying for the program would require increasing your taxes by [$400 per year ($40 per month)], would you want your representative in the state legislature to vote for the program expansion?

☐ → Yes
☐ → No
☐ → Don’t know or not sure
What kinds of programs would you prefer?

Suppose the [STATE] legislature were considering two budgets for expanding three programs. Suppose also that your representative sent you a letter asking which budget he or she should vote for if any.

Mental health program plus 2 of:
- Disaster Relief
- Motor-Vehicle Safety
- Food Safety
- Unemployment

---

### Example Question-Budget Priorities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>No Budget Change</th>
<th>Budget A</th>
<th>Budget B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disaster-relief program</td>
<td>No change</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="500 more people helped per year" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="250 more people helped per year" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental-health program</td>
<td>No change</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="1,000 more people helped per year" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="500 more people helped per year" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motor-vehicle-safety program</td>
<td>No change</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="260 fewer serious injuries per year" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="150 fewer serious injuries per year" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in your taxes</td>
<td>No increase</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="No Budget Change" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Budget A" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Budget A" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Budget B" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Which option would you want your representative to vote for?
What is the value to you of a program to treat [named condition]?

Suppose the [STATE] legislature were considering expanding an existing mental-health program to make a new effective medicine available specifically to people with [named condition] whose current treatment is not working for them. We would like you to think about the program expansion shown here.

Example question-Named condition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Current Budget</th>
<th>New Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increased number of people with [named condition] successfully treated</td>
<td>No change</td>
<td>1,000 more people per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase in your taxes</td>
<td>No increase</td>
<td>$480 per year ($40 per month)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Would you want your state representative to vote for the new budget?

- ☐ Yes → Double cost
- ☐ No → Halve cost
- ☐ Not sure → Halve cost
Challenges to Nonmarket Valuation

Validity

- Hypothetical bias
- Use values versus existence values
- Anchoring
- Yea-saying
- Incentive-compatibility
- Payment-vehicle effects

Stated-Preference Data as Evidence

Center for Devices Guidance

FDA-sponsored study on validity