

Improving healthcare decisions

**I Have a Better QALY than You:** *How to Make Sense of Alternatives to the QALY for Research and Policymaking* 

ISPOR 2024 – Atlanta, Georgia USA

May 7, 2024 1:45PM – 2:45PM



# Welcome and Session Objectives

Dan Ollendorf, PhD



## **Today's Panel**



### Dan Ollendorf (Moderator)

Chief Scientific Officer and Director of HTA Methods and Engagement Institute for Clinical and Economic Review (ICER) Assistant Professor Center for the Evaluation of Value and Risk in Health (CEVR), Tufts Medical Center



#### Darius Lakdawalla

Quintiles Chair in Pharmaceutical Development & Regulatory Innovation Professor, School of Pharmacy & Price School of Public Policy Director of Research, Leonard D. Schaeffer Center for Health Policy & Economics University of Southern California



#### **Mel Whittington**

Senior Fellow CEVR at Tufts Medical Center Principal Valusphere, LLC



### Anirban Basu

Stergachis Family Endowed Professor and Director Comparative Health Outcomes, Policy, and Economics (CHOICE) Institute, School of Pharmacy University of Washington



## **Session Objectives**

- Understand concerns with the QALY and its applications in health
- Present the pros and cons of major QALY alternatives
  - Equal value life year (evLY)
  - Health years in total (HYT)
  - Generalized risk-adjusted QALY (GRA-QALY)
- Discuss implications for health technology assessment and future research



Improving healthcare decisions

# Setting the Stage for Today's "Contest"

Dan Ollendorf, PhD



### **Disclosures**

 Current employee of the Institute for Clinical and Economic Review, which employs one of the measures under discussion

<sup>-imination</sup> Against

Show author details ~



# The Poor QALY



# **Morning Briefing**

Summaries of health policy coverage from major news organizations



House Passes Bill Barring Use Of QALY Metric In Federal Health Programs

(e

'justed life 'e policy

Reprints



DOQA

Ane

effe

Feng X

Show more

### There Have Been Attempts to Save it (Here)

RSTOPINION

Police
Controversy surrounds the questionable objectivity of the quality-of-life measurement, the ethics of discriminating between patients on age grounds alone, and the lack of sensitivity to equity considerations...to all of this, however, the QALY supporter can say: fine, tell me what you want to incorporate into the measure, and I will find a way to do so. Or, more belligerently, she might say, fine, if you don't like QALYs, how do you want to prioritize scarce resources and expensive treatments?



# **POLL QUESTION #1**



## QALY Alternatives: A Shot Across the Bow

- HYT
  - "can violate the 'independence of irrelevant alternatives' (IIA) axiom"
  - "produce counterfactual QoL after death"
  - "constant proportional tradeoff assumption provides no support for the notion that quality and quantity of life are separable..."
- evLY
  - "can result in decision instability"

Paulden M, Sampson C, O'Mahony JF, Spackman E, McCabe C, Round J, Snowsill T. Logical Inconsistencies in the Health
Years in Total and Equal Value of Life-Years Gained. Value Health. 2024 Mar;27(3):356-366. doi: 10.1016/j.jval.2023.11.009. Epub 2023 Dec 3. PMID: 38048985.





# Let the Games Begin!









# The equal value Life Year (evLY)

Mel Whittington, PhD



# Health Years in Total (HYT)

Anirban Basu, PhD



# Generalized risk-adjusted QALY (GRA-QALY)

Darius Lakdawalla, PhD



# Discussion







# **POLL QUESTION #2**



## **Potential Discussion Questions**

- We have talked about methods/use limitations of the alternatives. What are any political implications for their use?
- How would use of these measures impact patterns or trends in technology development?
- Some may view the alternatives as "bolt-ons" or reimaginings of the QALY. Is there merit in scrapping the whole enterprise and building something new from the ground up, or have we been there before?