The Influence of Extracurricular Activities on Radiology Resident Selection Decisions

Charles M. Maxfield, J. Felipe Montano-Campos, Lars Grimm

Background and Motivation
- United States medical schools are increasingly eliminating comparative student performance metrics.
- Step-1 examination: Pass/Fail reporting rather than a 3-digit numerical score.
- The loss of trusted academic performance metrics -> holistic review of residency applications.
- Extracurricular Activities (EAs) listed on radiology residency applications can signal traits and characteristics desired in holistic reviews.

Objective
- We sought an objective analysis to determine the influence of EAs on resident selection decisions.
- To date, there is no empirical research published on the influence of EAs on resident selection decisions.

Methods: Discrete Choice Experiment
- Subjects: Faculty participants from 30 US academic and community radiology departments.
- Attributes of the experiment (based on published data and residency application data)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Levels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medical School</td>
<td>Top 10, midlevel ranked, unranked</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Female, Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USMLE Step 1 score</td>
<td>Pass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USMLE Step 2 score</td>
<td>213, 229, 248, 267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class rank</td>
<td>1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th quartile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core clerkship honors</td>
<td>1,5,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extracurricular activities</td>
<td>22 EAs (attending the ballet, bible study, LGBTQ Pride Alliance, Swimming, etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The design of the instrument:
- The influence of EAs on resident selection decisions is significant and likely to gain importance (performance metrics eliminated).
- Participants preferred EAs that reflected active over passive engagement, progressive over conservative roles (leader versus team), and socioeconomic status (high versus low).

Results of the DCE with EAs grouped based on individual participant preferences (level 4 the most preferred and level 1 the least preferred).

- Participants preferred EAs that reflected active over passive engagement, progressive over conservative roles (leader versus team), and socioeconomic status (high versus low).
- Compared to male evaluators, female evaluators rated “Volunteer, Elizabeth Warren for President” more favorably.

Discussion
- The influence of EAs on resident selection decisions is significant and likely to gain importance (performance metrics eliminated).
- Applicants and Selection Committees should consider this influence and the bias that EAs can bring to resident selection decisions.